Case 2965

Siboma atraria Girard, 1856 (currently *Gila atraria*; Osteichthyes, Cypriniformes): proposed conservation of the specific name

Carter R. Gilbert

Florida Museum of Natural History, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611–2035, U.S.A.

Abstract. The purpose of this application is to conserve the specific name of *Gila atraria* (Girard, 1856), the common Utah chub of the western United States. Another of Girard's names, *Tigoma lineata*, is a synonym and has precedence due to a nomenclatural decision by Evermann & Rutter (1895); however, *lineata* has not been used in recent decades and its suppression is proposed.

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; Osteichthyes; Cypriniformes; United States; Utah chub; *Gila atraria*; *Tigoma lineata*.

---

1. Girard (1856) described the new cyprinid nominal species *Siboma atraria* and *Tigoma lineata* from the western United States, on pp. 208 and 206 respectively.

2. *S. atraria* was 'found in a spring, in Utah District, near the Desert, by Lt. E.G. Beckwith'. There is a single specimen (USNM 236; standard length 125.7 mm) in the U.S. National Museum. The type locality was later restricted by Snyder (1921, p. 25) to Fish Springs, in the southern part of Tooele County, Utah.

3. *T. lineata* was also collected by Beckwith, but the type locality was not stated and the only information consists of the handwritten 'Near 38°N. lat.' on labels accompanying the extant types (see para. 7 below). Although six syntypes (USNM 229) are supposed to have existed originally (Girard, 1858, pp. 292–293), apart from a single pharyngeal arch they disappeared long ago from the USNM collection (paras. 6 and 7 below).

4. Although Jordan (1878, p. 424; also 1885b, p. 819) listed both *S. atraria* and *T. lineata* he noted the latter as being a 'doubtful species', and omitted it from other contemporary publications (Jordan, 1885a; 1891a; 1891b). *T. lineata* was not included among the synonyms of *Leuciscus atrarius* (Girard, 1856) in the last three works.

5. Evermann's paper (1893) on Montana and Wyoming fishes used (pp. 23, 46; pl. 20, fig. 3) the name *L. atrarius* for the Utah chub and did not mention *T. lineata*, but despite this Evermann & Rutter (1895, p. 483) synonymized Girard's two nominal species under the name *Leuciscus lineatus*. They gave no reason for the choice of specific name but presumably it was based on the original page priority (cf. para. 1 above). Their action qualifies as that of first reviser under Article 24a of the Code. Jordan & Evermann (1896, p. 233) noted under *L. lineatus* 'locality unknown, type lost'.

6. Following Evermann & Rutter (1895) the name *L. lineatus* was used for the Utah chub for 22 years (e.g. Lucas, 1900, pp. 223–224; Fowler, 1913, p. 71), but the

total number of references was small. Snyder (1917, p. 59) disputed Evermann & Rutter's synonymy, arguing that the slender body mentioned in Girard's original description of *T. lineata* was more typical of species of the genus *Richardsonius* Girard (1856, p. 201). This conclusion has been accepted ever since. Snyder (1921, pp. 26–27) noted that the pharyngeal arch of *T. lineata* in the U.S. National Museum with two rows of teeth (dental formula 2,4-) bears a close resemblance to pharyngeal arches of *Richardsonius hydrophlox* (Cope, 1871) (= *R. balteatus hydrophlox*), the redside shiner.

7. Although the syntypes of *T. lineata* were thought to have been lost, at least three are known to exist, all in good condition; during the 1860's they had been sent by the U.S. National Museum on exchange to other museums in this country and abroad. Fowler (1925, pp. 399–400, fig. 8) described and illustrated a type specimen (ANSP 4188) in the collection of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia but did not comment on its supposed identity with *R. balteatus hydrophlox*; Böhlke (1984, p. 81) reported that Dr Robert R. Miller, University of Michigan, had identified this specimen as *Gila atraria*. The two other known syntypes are in the Museum of Comparative Zoology, Harvard University (MCZ 1807) and the Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle in Paris (MNHN 394); I have identified all three specimens as being *G. atraria*.

8. Apart from the period 1895–1917 (see para. 6 above) the specific name *atraria* has been consistently used for the Utah chub for the past 139 years. This is an abundant fish throughout its range, and numerous references have appeared in both the ichthyological and fisheries literature in recent decades (e.g. Neuhold, 1955; John, 1959; Graham, 1961; La Rivers, 1962; Sigler & Miller, 1963; Carlander, 1969; Baxter & Simon, 1970; Brown, 1971; Simpson & Wallace, 1978; Wallace, 1980; Robins et al., 1991; Mayden et al., 1992). Although, following the first reviser action of Evermann & Rutter (1895; see para. 5 above), the valid name should be *Gila lineata*, to change to this from *G. atraria* would be both unnecessary and confusing; under Article 79 of the Code there is a prima facie case for suppressing the specific name *lineata*.

9. This application is supported by Drs R.M. Bailey, B.M. Burr, R.C. Cashner, B.B. Collette, S. Contreras-Balderas, W.N. Eschmeyer, D. Hendrickson, R.R. Miller, J.S. Nelson, W.F. Smith-Vaniz and J.D. Williams.

10. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:

(1) to use its plenary powers to suppress the specific name *lineata* Girard, 1856, as published in the binomen *Tigoma lineata*, for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy;

(2) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the name *atraria* Girard, 1856, as published in the binomen *Siboma atraria*;

(3) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology the name *lineata* Girard, 1856, as published in the binomen *Tigoma lineata* and as suppressed in (1) above.

References

Baxter, G.T. & Simon, J.R. 1970. Wyoming fishes. *Bulletin of the Wyoming Game and Fish Department*, **4**: 1–168.

Böhlke, E.B. 1984. Catalogue of type specimens in the ichthyological collection of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia. *Special Publications of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, no. 14. vii, 246 pp.

Brown, C.J.D. 1971. *Fishes of Montana*. Big Sky Books, Missoula, Montana.

Carlander, K.D. 1969. *Handbook of freshwater fishery biology*, vol. 1. vi, 752 pp. Iowa State University Press, Ames, Iowa.

Evermann, B.W. 1893. A reconnaissance of the streams and lakes of western Montana and northwestern Wyoming. *Bulletin of the United States Fish Commission*, **11**(1891): 1–60, pls. 1–26.

Evermann, B.W. & Rutter, C. 1895. The fishes of the Colorado basin. *Bulletin of the United States Fish Commission*, **14** (1894): 473–486.

Fowler, H.W. 1913. Some type-specimens of the American cyprinoid fishes of the genus *Rutilus*. *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, **65**: 66–71.

Fowler, H.W. 1925. Notes on North American cyprinoid fishes. *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, **76**: 389–416.

Girard, C. 1856. Researches upon the cyprinoid fishes inhabiting the freshwaters of the United States of America west of the Mississippi Valley, from specimens in the museum of the Smithsonian Institution. *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, **8**: 165–213.

Girard, C. 1858. Fishes. General report of the zoology of the several Pacific railroad routes. *United States Pacific Railroad Survey*, vol. 10, no. 4. 400 pp., 76 pls.

Graham, R.J. 1961. Biology of the Utah chub in Hebgen Lake, Montana. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **90**(3): 269–276.

John, K.R. 1959. Ecology of the chub, *Gila atraria*, with special emphasis on vertebral curvatures, in Two Ocean Lake, Teton National Park, Wyoming. *Ecology*, **40**: 564–571.

Jordan, D.S. 1878. A catalogue of the fishes of the fresh waters of North America. *Bulletin of the United States Geological and Geographical Survey of the Territories*, **4**(2): 407–442.

Jordan, D.S. 1885a. Identification of the species of Cyprinidae and Catostomidae, described by Dr Charles Girard, in the Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia for 1856. *Proceedings of the United States National Museum*, **8**: 118–127.

Jordan, D.S. 1885b. A catalogue of the fishes known to inhabit the waters of North America, north of the Tropic of Cancer, with notes on the species discovered in 1883 and 1884. *Annual Report of the Commission for Fish and Fisheries*, **1885**: 787–973.

Jordan, D.S. 1891a. Report of explorations in Colorado and Utah during the summer of 1889, with an account of the fishes found in each of the river basins examined. *Bulletin of the United States Fish Commission*, **9**(1889): 1–40.

Jordan, D.S. 1891b. A reconnaissance of the streams and lakes of the Yellowstone National Park, Wyoming, in the interest of the United States Fish Commission. *Bulletin of the United States Fish Commission*, **9**(1889): 41–63.

Jordan, D.S. & Evermann, B.W. 1896. The fishes of North and Middle America: a descriptive catalogue of the species of fish-like vertebrates found in the waters of North America north of the Isthmus of Panama. *Bulletin of the United States National Museum*, vol. 47, no. 1. lx, 1240 pp.

La Rivers, I. 1962. *Fishes and fisheries of Nevada*. 782 pp. Nevada State Fish and Game Commission, State Printing Office, Carson City.

Lucas, F.A. 1900. Description of a new species of fossil fish from the Esmeralda Formation. Pp. 223–226 *in* Turner, H.W., The Esmeralda Formation, a freshwater lake deposit. *21st Annual Report, United States Geological Survey*, pp. 191–226.

Mayden, R.L., Burr, B.M., Page, L.M. & Miller, R.R. 1992. The native freshwater fishes of North America. Pp. 827–863 *in* Mayden, R.L. (Ed.), *Systematics, historical ecology, and North American freshwater fishes*. xxvi, 969 pp. Stanford University Press, Stanford.

Neuhold, J.M. 1955. Age and growth of the Utah chub, *Gila atraria* (Girard), in Panguitch Lake and Navajo Lake, Utah, from scales and opercular bones. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **85**: 217–233.

Robins, C.R., Bailey, R.M., Bond, C.E., Brooker, J.R., Lachner, E.A., Lea, R.N. & Scott, W.B. 1991. Common and scientific names of fishes from the United States and Canada. *Special Publication of the American Fisheries Society*, no. 20. 183 pp.

Sigler, W.F. & Miller, R.R. 1963. *Fishes of Utah*. 203 pp. Utah Department of Fish and Game, Salt Lake City.

Simpson, J. & Wallace, R. 1978. *Fishes of Idaho*. 237 pp. The University Press of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho.

Snyder, J.O. 1917. The fishes of the Lahontan system of Nevada and northeastern California. *Bulletin of the United States Bureau of Fishes*, **35**(1915–1916): 33–86.

Snyder, J.O. 1921. Notes on some western fluvial fishes described by Charles Girard in 1856. *Proceedings of the United States National Museum*, **59**: 23–28.

Wallace, R.L. 1980. *Gila atraria* (Girard), Utah chub. P. 160 *in* Lee, D.S. et al. (Eds.), *Atlas of North American freshwater fishes*. x, 854 pp. North Carolina State Museum of Natural History, Raleigh.